

KINGS LAW REPORTS

(ALL SC)

(1993) KLR VOL 8

Dedicated to the King of kings

O. O. NOEL ESQ. Chief Editor

INDEX OF CASES REPORTED

1. Warner & Warner Int. Associates (Nig) Ltd. v.
Federal Housing Authority p.
1 SC
2. Adenugba Adesina & Anor. v. Madam Tawa
Kola & 18 Ors. p.
38 SC
3. Ofoke Njoku v. The State p.
60 SC
4. Sylvester Ifeanyi Ibekendu v. Sylvester Ike p. 76 SC
5. C.O.P D' Dept. & Anor. v. Jimoh Oguntayo p. 106 SC
6. Alhaji Yusuf Dan Hausa & Co. Ltd. v. Penatrade
Ltd.
p. 106 SC
7. Fawole Ajayi & Anor. v. Igierobo Omorogbe p.119 SC
8. Alex Oladele Elufioye & 9 Others v. Ibrahim
Halilu & 17 Others p.
146 SC

SUPREME COURT JUSTICES

Hon. Justice Mohammed Bello - CJN
 Hon. Justice Muhammed Lawel Uwais
 Hon. Justice Adolphus Godwin Karibi – Whyte
 Hon. Justice Saidu Kawu
 Hon. Justice Modibbo Alfa Belgore
 Hon. Justice Abubakar Bashir Wali
 Hon. Justice Olajide Olatawura
 Hon. Justice Uche Omo
 Hon. Justice Idris Legbo Kutigi
 Hon. Justice Michael Ekundayo Ogundare
 Hon. Justice Emmanuel Ogwugbu

APPEALS - Court of Appeal's finding - not based on evidence - whether justified - submission that findings of the trial court were not challenged - when held to be erroneous. Warner & Warner Ltd v. F.H.A. p.1 SC.

APPEALS - Court of Appeal - failure to consider attacked findings of trial court - merely because it resolved issue of breach of contract in defendant's favour - whether proper. Warner & Warner Ltd v. F.H.A. p.1 SC.

APPEALS - Raising of an issue on detinue - when Court of Appeal's award was for conversion - whether of any use. C.O.P. v. Oguntayo. p.92 SC.

APPEALS - Appellant's brief - prescribed period within which to file brief - Registrar's notice for parties to collect record of appeal - purpose thereof. Ajayi v. Omorogbe. p.119 SC.

APPEALS - Record of appeal - duty of an appellant - in respect of the record - when the appellant is deemed tardy in the prosecution of the appeal. Ajayi v. Omorogbe. p.119 SC.

APPEALS - Appellant's brief - prescribed period within which to file the brief - whether computation of time starts from the time the record of appeal was collected by appellant - or the time the Registrar's notice was issued. Ajayi v. Omorogbe. p.119 SC.

BRIEFS - Appellant's brief - prescribed period within which to file the brief - whether computation of time starts from the time the record of appeal was collected by appellant - or the time the Registrar's notice was issued. Ajayi v. Omorogbe. p.119 SC.

CIVIL CAUSES - Action for wrongful termination of contract - award of damages by trial court - set aside by the Court of Appeal - when to be restored in part by the Supreme Court. Warner & Warner Ltd v. F.H.A. p. 1 SC.

CIVIL CAUSES - Successful proof of indebtedness whether to be affected by fact of counter claim. Warner & Warner Ltd v. F.H.A. p.1 SC.

CIVIL CAUSES - Action for money had and received - whether maintainable against solicitor to the defendants - when conduct of a solicitor is declared unethical. Adesina v. Kola. p.38 SC.

CIVIL CAUSES - Compulsory acquisition of land by Government - claim determined by the Land Tribunal - whether non-parties to the claim are entitled to benefit therefrom. Adesina v. Kola. p.38 SC.

CIVIL CAUSE - Trade Union - alleged breach of provisions of a Trade Union's constitution by officers -in overstaying their term of office without organising elections - right conferred on individual members of the Union to initiate action at their own expense - whether the common law rule in Foss v. Harbottle is applicable - where Plaintiff's complaint is against ultra vires act by the company - whether the first exception to the common law arises. Elufioye v. Halilu. p.146 SC.

CIVIL CLAIM - Contracts - claim on quantum meruit when held not to arise - erroneous striking out of defendant's counter claim - not a bar to the consideration of the plaintiff's claim. Warner & Warner Ltd v. F.H.A. p.1SC.

CIVIL PROCEDURE - Striking out of plaintiff's claim in its absence - proceeding with the defendant's counter - claim - without issuing hearing notice to the plaintiff - whether proper. Dan Hausa Ltd v. Panatrade Ltd. p.106 SC.

COMMON LAW - The rule in Foss v. Harbottle - when the second exception to the rule - is held not to arise. Elufioye v. Halilu p.146 SC.

CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS - Where the civil rights and obligations of the plaintiffs are affected - powers conferred on the court by S. 6(6) (6) of the 1979 Constitution - whether detrimentally affected by the rule in Foss v. Harbottle - as to deny locus standi to plaintiffs. Elufioye v. Halilu. p. 146 SC.

CONTRACTS - Contract agreement - whether varied subsequently - or stuck by the parties - where no completion date is stated in the agreement - whether time for completion is contemplated. Warner & Warner Ltd v. F.H.A. p.1 SC.

CONTRACTS - Building contracts - submission that time is never of the essence in such contracts - whether correct - instead where time is not of the essence in inception of the building contract - nor subsequently. Warner & Warner Ltd v. F.H.A. p.1 SC

CONTRACTS - Termination of contract - without complying with the provisions - whether such termination can be valid - when a breach of contract - is deemed to have been committed. Warner & Warner Ltd. v. F.H.A. p.1 SC.

COURTS - Comment by trial Judge - not founded on evidence - whether justified. Njoku v. The State. p.60 SC.

COURTS - Trial Court's failure to consider an issue properly raised - whether it leads to wrongful dismissal of claim - when appellate court will intervene. Ibekundu v. Ike. p.76 SC.

COURTS - Court of Appeal's discretion - to dismiss an appeal for want of prosecution - things that the court will take into consideration - contention that the court failed to consider counter-affidavit - whether correct. Ajayi v. Omorogbe. p.119 SC.

COURTS - Preliminary objection - where trial Judge goes far beyond what is required in reaching a conclusion at the preliminary stage - that ought only to be reached at the final stage - is it proper for the same Judge to continue hearing of the substantive action. Elufioye

v. Halilu. p.146 SC.

CRIMINAL LAW - Murder - self-defence - allegation of inadequate consideration of - whether sustainable - what accused must prove - so as to be entitled to self - defence. Njoku v. The State. p.60 SC.

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Murder trial - Expressed or implied defences open to the accused - Whether trivial - Where the consideration thereof - is binding on the trial court. Njoku v. The State. p.60 SC

DAMAGES - Awarded by trial court - on debt items - when not to be interfered with - confirmation of some damages awarded by trial court - whilst varying an item - for being speculative. Warner & Warner Ltd v. F.H.A. p.60 SC.

EVIDENCE - Award of aspect of damages - by the trial court - not based on evidence - whether proper. Warner & Warner v. F.H.A. p.1 SC.

EVIDENCE - Murder - no evidence or past aggressiveness of deceased - claim that attack on deceased was preemptive - whether justifiable - prosecution's evidence - whether contradictory. Njoku v. The State. p.60 SC.

EVIDENCE - Negligence - onus of proof on the plaintiff - where res ipsa loquitur is applicable - stage at which onus shifts to the defendant. Ibekendu v. Ike. p.76 SC.

EVIDENCE - Serious contradictions in evidence - trial judge's speculative findings - whether capable of curing the unreliability of such evidence. Ibekendu v. Ike. p.76 SC.

EVIDENCE - Complaint against admissibility of document - not raised at the proper stage - whether or any substance. Ibekendu v. Ike. p.76 SC.

EVIDENCE - Shifting of burden of proof - from plaintiff to defendant and vice versa - where plaintiff has discharged his burden - when burden of proof will shift to defendant. C.O.P. v. Oguntayo. p. 92 SC.

EVIDENCE - Death of two material witnesses who could not testify - existence of cogent evidence - in proof of plaintiff's title to property - when alleged falsity of business name and addresses - will not affect valid proof of title. C.O.P. v. Oguntayo. p.92 SC.

JUDICIAL PRECEDENTS - Earlier decision of the Supreme Court in Abubakri v. Smith - Suo Motu issue raised by the Supreme Court as to what effect s.6(6) (6) of the 1979 constitution will have on the said decision. Elufioye v. Halilu. p.146 SC.

JURISDICTION - Acquisition of land for state use - whether the high court had jurisdiction - are the plaintiffs entitled to judgment - when they raised the issue of trial court's lack of jurisdiction. Adesina v. Kola. p.38 SC.

JURISDICTION - Proceeding with hearing of counter claim - without giving hearing notice to plaintiff who was absent - whether court lacked jurisdiction. Dan Hausa Ltd v. Panatrade Ltd. p.106 SC.

LAND ACQUISITION - By the State Government - under the Public Lands Acquisition Law 1959 - proper time within which to make claims Adesina v. Kola. p.38 SC.

LEGISLATION - Trade Union Act 1973 - provision authorising any five members to take legal action - whether applicable in this case - to grant locus standi to plaintiffs. Elufioye v. Halilu. p.146 SC.

LITIGANTS - Non-prosecution of a case - not occasioned by Solicitor's fault but by the litigant - in disregard of rules of court - whether court's favour can be received - whether illness and poverty of litigant can justify delay. Ajayi v. Omorogbe. p.119 SC.

LOCUS STANDI - Trade Union - action against strong prima facie breaches of the Union's Constitution - by individual members of the Union - whether the plaintiffs have locus standi. Elufioye v. Halilu. p.146 SC.

MAXIMS - Audi alteram partem (you must hear the other party) - when held to have been violated. *Dan Hausa Ltd v. Panatrade Ltd.* p.1 06 SC.

PERSONAL PROPERTY - Seizure of plaintiff's vehicle by the police - valid establishment of better ownership to vehicle and possession - whether seizure of property is unlawful. *C.O.P. v. Oguntayo.* p.92 SC.

PLEADINGS - Res ipsa loquitor - Where it can be based on facts pleaded and evidence before the court - Whether it must specifically be pleaded. *Ibekendu v. Ike.* p.76 SC.

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Striking out of counter claim - By the trial Judge - When not justified - Proper order to be made. *Warner & Warner Ltd. v. F.H.A.* p. 1 SC.

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Alternative claims - whether the court can be shut out from considering an alternative claim - because the main claim failed. *Ibekendu v. Ike.* p.76 SC.

RES IPSA LOQUITUR - When the doctrine is applicable - whether failure to prove particulars of negligence - is a bar to application of doctrine. *Ibekendu v. Ike.* p.76 SC.

TORTS - Motor accident - allegation of negligence against the driver - not proved. *Ibekendu v. Ike.* p.76 SC.

TORTS - Detention of vehicle by the Police - on ground of true owner not having been round - where plaintiff has established valid title - when action for conversion will succeed for wrongfully impounding a vehicle. *C.O.P. v. Oguntayo.* p.92 SC.

WORDS & PHRASES - "May" - Used in relation to giving hearing notice or counter claim to the plaintiff - Under the High Court Rules - Whether mandatory or directory. *Dan Hausa. v. Panatrade Ltd.* p.106 SC.

INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES

1. Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria I 979. s. 236. *Adesina v. Kola* p.38 Se. 533(1) *Dan Hausa Ltd v. Panatrade Ltd.* p.106 Se. SS 213(3) s33. *Ajayi v. Omorogbe.* P.119 SC. ss6(6) (b), 236 (1). *Elufioye v. Halilu* p.146 SC.
2. Court of Appeal Rule Order 3 Rule 6. *Warner &. Warner Ltd. v. F.H.A.* p.1 Se. Order 3 Rule 8, order 3rr. 13(2),20(1) (3),25(1). *Ajayi v. Omorogbe.* p.119 SC.
3. Criminal Cock s. 319 (1) Cap. 30 vol. II, Laws or the Eastern Nigeria 13, *Njoku v. The State* p.60 SC.
4. Evidence Act s. 137, S.178. *Njoku v. The State* p.60 SC; S76 *Ibekendu v. Ike* p.76 se; ss 134, 135, 136, 137 &. 139, 146. *C.O.P. v. Oguntayo* p.92 SC.
5. High Court (Civil Procedure) Rules 1976 of Sokoto State, Order 24 Rule 5(2) & 6, Order 5 Rule 2. *Dan Hausa Ltd. v. Panatrade Ltd.* p. 106 SC.
6. High Court Rules (1985) Order 35 Rule 7. *Ibekendu v. Ike.* p.76 Se. Order 39 Rule 2. *Elurioye v. Halilu.* p.76 SC.
7. Public Lands Acquisition (Miscellaneous Provision) Act No. 33 1976 553(b), 13, 14. *Adesina v. Kola* p.38 SC.
8. Public Lands Acquisition Law s 10 (2) Cap. 105, Laws of Nigeria, 1951J. *Adesina v. Kola* p.38 SC.
9. Trade Union Act 1973 No. 31 s. 16 (1). *Elufioye v. Halilu* p.146 SC.